

UTCP Uehiro Booklet No.2
Philosophy of Disability & Coexistence:
Body, Narrative, and Community

Kohji Ishihara and Minae Inahara (eds.)

Preface

Kohji Ishihara

Research Papers

1. Physical Disability and Abjection: between Acceptance and Rejection
Minae Inahara
2. Empathetic Identification and Person Perception in the Ashley Case
Yuh Miyahara
3. Woman's Body and Surrogacy
Hitomi Saitoh
4. Trauma and Literature: Women began to speak about their experiences
Arisa Iwakawa
5. Expressions of Disability in the Context of Islam
Yuta Komura
6. Ethics of Disability and Experimental Ethics for Coexistence: A Reflection on the Status of Intuitions
Kazuki Iijima
7. From Psychopathology to Tojisha-kenkyu: Tojisha-kenkyu as Phenomenological Practice in a *Phenomenological Community*
Kohji Ishihara
8. Between Two Worlds: A Phenomenological Critique of the Medical and Social Models of Disability
Michael Gillan Peckitt, Minae Inahara, and Jonathan Cole

Tojisha-kenkyu Case Study

From Accepting Existing Terms to Creating Original Terms: Reflections on Tojisha-kenkyu and the 'Picture Frame' Problem

Mitsuru Mizutani

Report from UTCP/PhDC 1st International Conference on Philosophy of Disability:
Disability Studies and Tojisha Kenkyu

Tojisha Kenkyu practice for people with mental disorder in the Republic of Korea

Dae Hwan Kim (Translator: Kyungnam Moon)

In the middle of self-transformation

Nak Woo Kim (Translator: Kyungnam Moon)

Translation (Japanese)

Enactive intersubjectivity: Participatory sense-making and mutual incorporation (from *Phenom Cogn Sci* (2009) 8: 465–486)

Thomas Fuchs & Hanne de Jaegher (Translator: Shogo Tanaka)

Contributors

Kohji Ishihara Associate Professor, Graduate School of Arts and Sciences, The University of Tokyo

Minae Inahara Assistant Professor, Graduate School of Letters, Osaka University

Hitomi Saitoh Part-time lecturer, Nihon University (Distance Learning Division)

Yuh Miyahara Part-time lecturer, Iwaki-Meisei University

Arisa Iwakawa DC researcher of Japan Society for the Promotion of Science, The University of Tokyo

Yuta Komura PD researcher of Japan Society for the Promotion of Science, The University of Tokyo

Kazuki Iijima Ph.D. candidate, Graduate School of Arts and Sciences, The University of Tokyo

Michael Gillan Peckitt Honorary Research Associate, University of Hull (UK)

Jonathan Cole Honorary Senior Lecturer in Clinical Neurosciences, University of Southampton; Professor, University of Bournemouth; and Consultant in Clinical Neurophysiology, Poole and Salisbury Hospitals

Mitsuru Mizutani Member of Necco, Tojisha-Kenkyu Study Group

Dae Hwan Kim Director, Cheongju Mental Health Center

Nak Woo Kim User, Korea Center for Independent Life of Mentally Defective People

Kyungnam Moon Ph.D. candidate, Graduate School of Arts and Sciences, The University of Tokyo

Shogo Tanaka Associate Professor, Liberal Arts Education Center, Tokai University

Abstracts

Minae Inahara, “Physical Disability and Abjection: between Acceptance and Rejection”, pp. 11–25.

In this paper, I shall look at the way in which disability is constructed by examining Julia Kristeva’s theory of abjection and using my own experiences. Those with disabilities experience ‘stigma’ in relation to the type of disabilities that they have. The impact of stigma is twofold: social stigma is the reaction that the general population has to people with disabilities and self-stigma is the psychosomatic reaction which people with disabilities turn against themselves. In the first half of the paper, I shall discuss some issues regarding stigma, by reading Goffman’s social interactionist theory and the Hegelian dialectic and detailing the complexities of disabled experiences which always move between acceptance and rejection of their own disabilities. In the latter half of the paper, I shall consider whether physical disability should be recognised as abjection involved in the formation of the self, and question whether the formation of abject subjectivities is socially and psychosomatically formed. I argue that the disabled body is the abject body. Adapting Kristeva’s account of abjection, I open up the possibility of undoing the processes of abjection. With the intention of illustrating this complex process of undoing the abject, I shall analyse Steven Spielberg’s 1982 film *E.T.: The Extra-Terrestrial*. Finally, the paper suggests the ways in which ‘Tojisha-Kenkyu’ (Frist person and collaborative study) has attempted to resist processes of self-alienation and develops ways of incorporating ambiguities of physical disabilities rather than placing them in positions of opposition.

Yuh Miyahara, “Empathetic Identification and Person Perception in the Ashley Case”, pp. 27–41.

It is natural to feel uneasy about the ‘Ashley treatment’, a controversial treatment where a child with a developmental disability, ‘Ashley X’, was given a hysterectomy and bilateral breast bud removal, which limits a child’s growth. It is easy to criticize Ashley’s parent’s decision do so. The purpose of this essay, however, is not to criticize her parents, but to discuss the way we understand what was done to her. How can they decide whether to intervene in such a way? Comparing Ashley’s parent’s decision to that of another mother, Kodama, who has a daughter with a severe developmental disability, this essay explores the issue of medical intervention in such cases. Kodama confesses a profound empathy towards Ashley’s parents. At the same time, however, she raised an objection to decision of medical

intervention which was made by them. I argue that a difference between Ashley's parents and Kodama derives from a difference between empathetic identification and perception, and that Ashley's parents don't perceive Ashley as a person. Empathetic identification is needed and plays an important role in communication, and cannot be controlled by any one subject. Empathetic identification, however, is not enough for communication. On the other hand, understanding other persons is far more difficult than what we imagine. On a rush hour train, for example, we don't perceive a person as a person, who has a future and a past. We need an appropriate environment to perceive a person as a person. We can say that what Ashley's parents do have The problem of Ashley's parents is not a lack of a sense of morality, but of an appropriate environment.

Hitomi Saitoh, "Woman's Body and Surrogacy", pp.43–57.

In this paper, I shall offer an analysis of the modality of woman's body focusing especially on some matters regarding surrogacy. As the birth rate drops in Japan, assisted reproductive technology (in short a fertility treatment) becomes an important subject. The opportunity to rethink the modality of body increases under this circumstance. Not a few women are interested in the infertility treatment, and some women undergo actually treatment for infertility. As for the surrogacy, some people think that surrogacy is possible as one of the options for the fertility treatment. At the present time, there is no a special law banning surrogacy in Japan. However, the Japanese Society of Obstetrics and Gynaecology have guidelines that prohibit either the obstetrician or gynaecologist from assisting a surrogacy, so it isn't commonly used in Japan. Some people go overseas to find a surrogate-mother. But surrogacy is a controversial matter because there is a risk of a human rights violation. This is but one of many reasons for prohibiting a surrogacy. There are also other reasons which question the need for the surrogacy. However topics dealt with in this paper are limited and this paper doesn't directly answer problems regarding surrogacy. In this paper, by considering basic problems of surrogate, I shall offer an account arguing that woman's body has several layers, one that deeply situated in a variety of contexts.

Arisa Iwakawa, "Trauma and Literature: Women began to speak about their experiences", pp. 59–72.

The aim of this paper is to examine the process of recovering from trauma, as it is described in Oe Kenzaburo's novel *The Beautiful Annabel Lee was Chilled and Killed*. In this work, Oe illustrated, in detail, the process of one woman's recovery from her traumatic experience. The woman, Sakura Ogi Magarshack, a renowned actress, was sexually abused just after the

Second World War by the person who would later become her husband. At a certain time of her life, Komori Tamotu, who was a movie producer and an old friend of Sakura's showed her a film scene involving sexual abuse. Komori wanted to cure Sakura's trauma by showing her something drastic, a kind of shock therapy. But afterwards Sakura fell into a mental crisis and she lived in a hospital. Thirty years later Sakura made a movie, based on her own traumatic experience. Sakura regained and transformed her traumatic memory through making a new movie with a lot of women who supported her. This process illustrates the importance of a safe environment if one is be open to relating to others within a community. In this paper, I stress that feminism has empowered women to speak out about their traumatic experiences. It is difficult to speak out about individual traumatic experiences, but this novel gives us a new model, through which we can understand the process of recovery from a traumatic experience.

Yuta Komura, "Expressions of Disability in the Context of Islam", pp. 73– 87.

This article deals with the expressions of disability which were expressed in the context of Islam. And in this article, we especially took three books as our subjects; *al-Qur'ān*, *al-Hadīth*, and *Kitāb alif laylah wa-laylah*. The last one is also called as *The Arabian Nights*. Of *sūrah* (chapter) of the *Qur'ān*, we analyzed two *sūrah*, the chapter of the Victory (*sūrah al-fath*), and the chapter of the Light (*sūrah al-nūr*). In these chapters, they treat those who have disability with their physical powers, and regard them as normal members in their community as possible. This means that they are exempt from their responsibilities, especially going to wars, and that they should not be discriminated whatsoever. On the other hand, the *Hadīth*, which is sayings of the prophet Muḥammad, treats more particular problems than the *Qur'ān* does. Because of the *Hadīth* being articulated directly from the prophet, it contains more actual cases. Here we examined the case with a blind man who has a difficulty with going to the mosque, which was reported by Abū Hurayrah. And finally, we argued the *Arabian Nights*. Although the former two were religious text, this one is a pure literature work, more than that, it is notorious with its eroticism, hedonism, and bad taste. Of these tales, we especially looked into the tale of the Hunchback, which has a collection of disabilities in that. The tale has a nesting structure, and many speakers represent their tales in turns. But in every tales, there appears at least one person with a (in some case, some) disabilities. It has some cruelty, it is true, but these tales surely represent *la vie quotidienne* of the medieval peoples lively.

Kazuki Iijima, “Ethics of Disability and Experimental Ethics for Coexistence: A Reflection on the Status of Intuitions”, pp. 89– 113.

Philosophical inquiries on disability should rest on precise empirical understandings of the nature of disability; meanwhile, philosophical inquiries regarding people with disability themselves should take place in the presence of disabled others, where coexistence with disability is realized. The paper aims to establish a firm methodological basis for the philosophy of disability and to facilitate coexistence with those with disability. I particularly focus on the methodology of ethics, and discuss the uses and limitations of intuitions, which have played important roles in the tradition. Firstly, I examine the roles and properties of moral intuitions in ethics, and explicate the recent situations, where traditional practices of using intuitions were viewed with suspicion by empirical evidence. Secondly, I examine the adequacy of the approaches regarding competence/performance distinctions, which try to seek rational intuitions. Finally, I discuss the refinement of the methodology of John Rawls, as pertains to the concept of reflective equilibrium. I propose that the empirical evidence should input into the processes of seeking a reflective equilibrium, and that the possibility of coexistence works as constraints of these processes to the reflective equilibrium. I conclude that moral principles should be explored in order to facilitate coexistence with disabled others. Such a teleological conception of the inquiry into moral principles justifies and necessitates the need to incorporate moral judgments of people with disability into practice of ethics. I also emphasize the importance of actively incorporating empirical evidence, including inquiries on moral competence of people with disability, into philosophical theorizing.

Kohji Ishihara, “From Psychopathology to Tojisha-kenkyu: Tojisha-kenkyu as Phenomenological Practice in a *Phenomenological Community*”, pp. 115– 137.

This paper aims at to (1) examine Jaspers’ phenomenology and phenomenological psychopathology as attempts to grasp the experiences of individuals with mental disorders and (2) interprets Tojisha-kenkyu as an alternative phenomenological practice. Drawing on the method of empathy, Jaspers’ phenomenology sought to grasp the mental life of “patients” from within; however, empathy presupposes similarity and the essential uniformity of mind, suppositions which are not applicable to the “morbid mental life”. Jaspers’ methodological demarcation of phenomenology from such approaches as objective psychology, understanding psychology, and explanatory psychology is also dubious. Meanwhile, “phenomenological psychopathology,” which draws on Husserl and Heidegger, also has some difficulty in approaching the experiences of patients, in so far as it understands these as “modifications”

of the normal experiences. This paper suggests an alternative phenomenological approach by calling attention to the phenomenological view that regards reality as the correlate of the experiencing subject. It also suggests the concept of (heterogeneous) “phenomenological community,” which is made up of those who co-constitute the common world, while taking into account the perspectives and heterogeneous experiences of its members. Such a phenomenological community includes individuals with mental disorders, their family members, supporters, related professionals, and researchers; in addition, it embraces individuals without direct interest in mental disorders but who participate in constructing the reality of mental disorders. This idea comes from a reflection on “Tojisha-kenkyu,” which began in Urakawa, Japan in 2001 among individuals with mental disorders and their supporters. “Tojisha-kenkyu”, First person study of mental disorders, can be interpreted as phenomenological practice based on the phenomenological community. This interpretation of Tojisha-kenkyu permits the renewal of phenomenology as a method to approach the experiences of individuals with mental disorders.

Michael Gillan Peckitt, Minae Inahara, and Jonathan Cole, “Between Two Worlds: A Phenomenological Critique of the Medical and Social Models of Disability”, pp. 139–153.

Research into disability is guided by two models. The first model is the medical model, which states that disability is a medical condition to be catalogued and if possible, treated. The social model, which was initially advanced by advocates of disability rights in the 1970’s, states that disability is a social condition, not something to be ‘fixed’ by medicine. These two models, or a version of them guides all research into disability, and yet each model leaves some aspect of disability out, the medical ignores the social aspects, and at its strongest variant, the social model denies the disability has anything to do with medicine. In this talk we shall argue that whilst both models have been useful, since both ignore crucial aspects of disability, both ultimately fail to provide an accurate picture of disability. Using the phenomenology of Merleau-Ponty, and drawing upon the work of the neurologist Jonathan Cole, We shall present a phenomenological description of two people with cerebral palsy, an umbrella term for a condition which affects them socially in entirely different ways. By presenting such a phenomenology, we aim to show that phenomenology may offer a third way of understanding disability, that can take the best of the social and the medical models and arrive at a more accurate depiction of disability.

Mitsuru Mizutani, “From Accepting Existing Terms to Creating Original Terms: Reflections on Tojisha-kenkyu and the ‘Picture Frame Problem’”, pp. 157– 171.

I have been seeing more than a dozen of psychiatrists and psychotherapists for the past twelve and a half years. In the first section of this paper, I will look back over the course of how I became mentally ill and finally came to be involved in Tojisha-kenkyu. Then, I will relate the experiences I have had with my doctors and therapists in relation to technical and other terms describing diagnoses, symptoms, life events and so on. With the exception of one doctor, they have been reluctant to clearly pronounce their diagnoses and use definitive words such as “abuse.” Based on that experience, I will argue that the relationship between professional knowledge of psychiatry and psychology and the professionals working in these fields is neither unanimous nor monolithic. Professional knowledge gives technical and other terms to patients/clients through publications and the Internet, whereas professionals in front of the patients/clients do not directly tell and explain these terms but rather induce them to browse through professional knowledge by giving medications and writing medical certificates. Consequently, the patients/clients are likely to be suspended in midair, wondering if they can really use these terms to describe themselves. There may be reasons why professionals tend to avoid using definitive words, and yet it is important and necessary for patients/clients to once be given and accept existing terms in order to question, shift and adapt them. Next, in the third and last section, I will reflect on the significance and uniqueness of Tojisha-kenkyu, which is a practice of creating original terms. The “Picture Frame Problem” is a new term which I have coined with my peers to describe the characteristic of my own ways of perception and cognition. Here the “picture frame” means a kind of limitations to define the field of attention. When there is a “picture frame,” that is, when I am given certain limits to what I have to see or listen or read and understand like when doing proofreading, I give attention to every single minute details and get meticulous information. On the contrary, when there is no “picture frame,” that is, when I am given no limits as is the case with everyday life, I tend to arbitrarily focus on what immediately leaps to the eyes and interpret information in a rather idiosyncratic way.